

# Policy Implementation On Employee Performance Benefits Of Ternate Election Commission Secretariat

Abdul Halil Hi. Ibrahim, Syaiful Madjid, Ade Kamaludin

**Abstract:** This research was conducted to analyze the implementation of the policy of providing employee performance benefits within the KPU Secretariat General, with the research locus of the KPU Secretariat of Ternate City. Informants in this study were employees of the Ternate City KPU Secretariat from the start of the supervisor (Secretary and Subdivision Head) to subordinates (secretariat staff). The purposes of this study are to reveal the factors that influence the success and obstacles of the implementation of the policy of providing employee performance benefits. Based on the results of the study, the Ternate City KPU Secretariat has not entirely been able to implement the provisions regulated by the KPU Secretary General Decree Number 53 of 2016 concerning the Technical Guidelines for the Implementation of Employee Performance Allowances in the KPU Secretariat General. The provisions are intended, one of which is the application of electronic attendance registration. Inconsistencies occur if you don't want to be called a "failure" in implementing electronic attendance records. Last only eight months (January to August 2017) and then switch again to how to register manual attendance until now. Other provisions that are ignored are the legality and professionalism of the performance allowance manager (Tukin).

**Index Terms:** Implementation, performance allowances, electronic attendance recording.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Indonesian bureaucracy after Suharto fall was at a crossroads, between those who want to maintain bureaucratic polity continuation and those who persist in maintaining bureaucratic reformation. The bureaucracy tendency to play politics during the reform era; it seems, has not been eliminated from Indonesia bureaucratic culture. Aggravated by bureaucratic tendency behavior that remains corrupt and has not changed the service culture to the public, increasingly seen in the Reformation period [1]. In enforcing bureaucratic reform context, there are five steps to bureaucratic reform; restructuring, participation, human resources, accountability, and interaction between the public and private sectors [2]. Restructuring both vertically and horizontally is vital to do so that government bureaucracies can be more efficient, effective, and responsive to the social, political, and economic dynamics that exist in society [3]. Understanding this restructuring, according to Dwiyanto (2014: 392) [3] does not stop as limited as bureaucratic downsizing. Bureaucratic reorganization here means structure re-adjusting of functions and tasks (tupoksi). Therefore the bureaucracy size is genuinely under its needs (rightsizing). Bureaucratic reform must also be followed by changes in attitudes and behavior of officials, changes in work processes and procedures, and changes in the overall sub-system and system [3]. In other words, changes in government bureaucracy must start from individual-level changes to system level changes.

There are three main objectives to be achieved from implementing bureaucratic reform; 1) the realization of a clean and free corruption, collusion and nepotism government; 2) increasing the quality of people public services, and 3) increasing capacity and accountability of bureaucratic performance. To accelerate achieved in bureaucratic reform implementation, the government has established 9 programs; 1) structuring government organizational; 2) structuring the number and distribution of civil servants; 3) development of open selection and promotion systems; 4) increasing the professionalization of civil servants; 5) development of an integrated electronic government system; 6) improving public services; 7) increased integrity and accountability of apparatus performance; 8) improving the welfare of civil servants; and 9) increasing the efficiency of apparatus spending.

Furthermore, as an effort to boost bureaucratic reform, rewards are given to ministries/ institutions and regional governments which are considered successful in implementing bureaucratic reform [4]. One of them is through the provision of performance allowances or regional performance allowances. This allowance is given in stages according to the progress of implementation achievement of bureaucratic reform. Within the general secretariat of the Indonesia general election commission (KPU), the bureaucratic reform implementation has been started since 2013. It is beginning with the sending of proposal documents and the reform road map within the KPU general secretariat. Furthermore, it continued with the bureaucratic reform team establishment that carried out activities following the road map. The next stage in 2014 was carried out a field verification process by the Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform which was a condition for the KPU to obtain an award in employee performance allowances determined through Presidential Regulation. On December 24, 2014, the Government issued Presidential Regulation No. 189/2014 concerning Employee Performance Allowances in KPU general secretariat, with a performance allowance of 40%. As a guideline in Presidential Regulation implementing on 15 April 2015 the Secretary-General of the KPU RI issued Decree No. 241/2015 concerning Technical Guidelines for Performance Allowances for Employees in the KPU Secretariat General Implementation. In 2015, the Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform again conducted an assessment

- Abdul Halil Hi. Ibrahim is Associate Professor of Social and Political Science Universitas Muhammadiyah Maluku Utara, Ternate, Indonesia, email: [halil\\_ibrahim@gmail.com](mailto:halil_ibrahim@gmail.com)
- Syaiful Madjid is Lecturer of Social and Political Science Universitas Muhammadiyah Maluku Utara, Ternate, Indonesia, email: [syaiful\\_madjid@yahoo.com](mailto:syaiful_madjid@yahoo.com)
- Ade Kamaludin is Master Student of Public Administration Universitas Muhammadiyah Maluku Utara, Ternate, Indonesia, email: [adekamaludin@gmail.com](mailto:adekamaludin@gmail.com)

of bureaucratic reform implementation within the Indonesia KPU general secretariat. The result of the appraisal is to get a value of 58.72%, and then it is declared eligible to obtain an increase of 60%. This increase was marked by the publishing of Presidential Regulation No. 157/2015 concerning Employee Performance Allowances in the KPU General Secretariat, replacing Presidential Regulation No. 189/2014. Therefore, the amount of Performance Allowance (Tukin) has experienced a two-fold increase: from 40% up to 60%. Within the four years of Tukin implementing, it is crucial to know and ensure whether bureaucratic reform marked by two times increases, take place systematically to regional KPU Secretariat. In Ternate City KPU Secretariat, Tukin implementation was supported by human and financial resources, as well as the readiness of facilities and infrastructure. The means of support are intended, one of which is a fingerprinting machine. This machine is one technology application by using fingerprints to improve work discipline [4]. Since everyone's fingerprints are not the same, with fingerprint, the attendance data is challenging to manipulate. The employees can no longer sign to their colleagues because fingerprint only records employee concerned. Following this machine works online and can be monitored from a computer connected to the device so that it makes it easy to reconcile employee attendance. Electronic attendance recording improves employee work discipline. KPU general secretary Decree No. 53/2016 gives a time limit to the local KPU Secretariat to implement electronic attendance records no later than June 2016. Ternate City KPU Secretariat has been performing electronic attendance records since 2017 but did not last long. Last only eight months, from January to August 2017. It is not impossible, returning to the manual recording of attendance will repeat the old problem. Employees can fill in time to attend and go home according to their wishes, or the worst is that the employee signs each other (fake signature). This dirty practice is easy to do if continuous supervision and strict action on this process are not carried out correctly. Based on the description above, this study aims to reveal whether Tukin implementation in the Ternate City KPU Secretariat is directly proportional or even contrary to the discipline of employee attendance. This study also wants to compare the employees' attendance rate when implementing an electronic attendance record for eight months (January to August 2017) with manual attendance recording afterward (September until December 2017).

## 2 METHODOLOGY

This study was used in qualitative research. In anthropology, it is known as field research or ethnography, but in education, it is known as fundamental research [6]. Qualitative research intends to understand the phenomenon of what is experienced by research subjects, such as behavior, perceptions, motivations, actions, etc., holistically, and utilizing descriptions in the form of words and languages, in an appropriate natural context and by using various scientific methods [7]. Whereas, this method involves means of observation, communication, and documentaries in the natural environment to understand the social world [8]. The technique used to investigate, find, describe, and explain the quality or features of social influences that cannot be defined, measured or described through a quantitative approach. Methods are based on the philosophy of post-positivism, used to examine the condition of natural objects (as opposed to experiments) in which researchers [9]. This research took place in Ternate City. Precisely at the office of the Ternate KPU having its address at Jalan Kalumata Puncak No. 02 Subdistrict of South Ternate City. KPU Office Ternate City is located adjacent to the white building or official residence of Ternate Mayor which is not occupied. There are two main reasons why the study chose Ternate City KPU office, that is a lot of human resources and using electronic attendance recording. The stages of the study are as follows; a) primary and secondary data collection; b) observation, in-depth interviews, and documentation; c) data analysis of the Miles and Huberman [11]; and d) validation.

## 3 DISCUSSIONS

### 3.1. Factors Affecting Implementation of Performance Allowance Policies

#### a. Communication

Socialization is an essential aspect of the entire policy process. Because the policies that have been made will be useful if socialized. This program in principle is a way for a strategy to achieve its objectives. The aim is to realize an orderly Tukin for employees within the KPU Secretariat.

The question is whether the KPU Secretary General's Decree Number 53/2016 has been well socialized within the Ternate City KPU Secretariat? Based on interview results, information was obtained that the socialization of performance allowances had been made to employees in the Ternate KPU Secretariat. The program was not carried out by the North Maluku Province KPU Secretariat, but Ternate KPU Secretariat. Other information is that the Tukin increase policy of 60% stipulated is not well socialized. The question is how does a leader socialize the Tukin policy well to his subordinates if the person concerned does not understand and implement the strategies set out. Weak socialization and consistency in carrying out policies that have been regulated in KPU Secretary General's Decree Number 53/2016, leaving administrative problems that have not been addressed until now, including; 1) the Ternate City KPU secretariat did not decree 2 Tukin managers, consisting of 1 Tukin data manager and one control book manager. This ignores the circular; 2) secretary of Ternate KPU is not consistent in implementing electronic attendance records because it only runs eight months (January 2017 until August 2017). Once again this ignores the Decree of the KPU which requires the Regency / City KPU Secretariat to carry out electronic attendance records in July 2016. Top-down communication in an organization has the understanding that information flows from higher authority positions to those with lower authority [11]. The effective communication can create a favorable condition in the organization which then affects employee job confidence and satisfaction which ultimately determines performance and motivation [12]. The three types of communication used in downward connection as follows; a) oral forms: meetings, discussions, interviews, telephone, intercom systems, interpersonal contacts, verbal reports, lectures; b) writing: letters, memos, telegram, magazines, newspapers, job descriptions, guidelines for carrying out work, written stories, policy guidelines; c) image form: graphics, posters, maps, films, slides [13]. This study found that top-down communication was related to a minimum policy of giving Tukin the use of written forms and prioritizing oral forms. From observations and interviews concluded that the lack of communication within the Ternate City KPU Secretariat, both in oral and written form. Communication writing related to information and provisions on electronic attendance and working hours tend to be exclusive or closed because employees can only read them in the Ternate City KPU Secretariat, which makes it private because the fingerprint is placed in a closed room, which is then transferred to a public office. Not much different from writing communication, oral communication in messages or information conveyed by top-down regarding the Tukin increase policy is also very minimal. It could be a choice of placing a fingerprint in a closed room and being moved again to a private room (public office) is a result of miscommunication.

## b. Resources

Moreover, in 2017, the budget available in the DIPA KPU Ternate City for Tukin payments of 23 civil servants is IDR. 819,294,600. With details of IDR. 782,436,000 for payment of Tukin per position class and IDR. 36,858,600 for tax payments, as seen in Table 1.

**Table 1.** Amount of budget performance allowance for employees of Ternate City KPU secretariat in 2017

Months	Tukin Per Grade (Rp)	Tax Benefits (Rp.)	Budget Amount (Rp)	Explanation
II	III	IV	V	VI
January	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	The tukin budget of
February	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	IDR. 68,274,550
March	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	per month was used for
April	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	Tukin payments for
May	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	23 employees of
June	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	the Ternate KPU
July	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	Secretariat
August	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	
September	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	
October	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	
November	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	
December	65.203.00 0	3.071.550	68.274.550	
Total	782.436.00 00	36.858.60 0	819.294.600	

Based on Table 1, it is read that the Tukin budget availability on KPU DIPA of the 2016-2017 budget year is included to pay for five employees placed in other work units. That means an excess of 5 Ternate City KPU employees did not cause Turkin's payment to be late. Because every month they receive directly into their respective accounts. The Tukin budget availability attached KPU DIPA has no problem. That means the right of each employee to obtain is not violated even though the employee is assigned to another work unit. How they fulfill their obligations honestly and trustfully, therefore received is following the weight of attendance per month that is recapitulated by the Tukin Manager in each work unit. The facilities and infrastructure needed to support Tukin policy implementation include fingerprint machine and placement space along with connecting devices such as computers and the internet. Decree of KPU General Secretary of KPU No. 53/2016 regulates the procedure for recording attendance in two ways: manual or electronic. And for manual recording only valid until June 2016. That means starting in July 2016, and the KPU has to implement electronic attendance records. The problem in the KPU DIPA for the 2016-2017 budget year there was no budget post for spending on fingerprint machines procurement. Then where did the Ternate City KPU take funds to buy the machine? Fingerprint machine is a grant from the Ternate City Government. Because in the DIPA KPU did not have the procurement budget. In its use, the fingerprint machine is damaged so that

the KPU again uses manual attendance. The problem is the lack of supervision, attention, initiative and leadership responsibilities regarding the electronic attendance recording policy — besides, the weakness supervising the performance of KPU Secretary. The Tukin manager is two people. One person as a Tukin Data Manager and another as a Control Book Manager. This is based on the Circular of the KPU Secretary General No. 849/2015, June 24, 2015, Subject: Appointment of Tukin Data Managers and Control Book Managers at local KPU Secretariat. In Ternate City KPU secretariat, the appointment of two Tukin Managers was not made in the Decree. The meeting was made verbally by KPU Secretary. Administratively Tukin Manager legality is questionable. The action who appointed Tukin Managers without a decree was contradicted by the law which stipulates appointment. While Control Book Managers, indeed the KPU Secretary General's Decree Number 53/2016 does not regulate must come from officials who handle staffing or not. The criteria confirmation has been stipulated in KPU Secretary General decree No. 849/2015 in point 2 letter b stating that the Control Book Manager appointment must meet at least five standards; Integrity, Discipline, Responsibility, Resolute, and Carefulness. The practice of bureaucracy that occurred within Ternate KPU Secretariat included 1 of 8 types of maladministration.

## c. disposition

Circular of KPU Secretary General No. 849/2015 dated June 24, 2015, Regarding Appointment of Tukin Data Manager and Control Book Manager, and KPU Secretary General's Decree No. 53/2016 dated January 26, 2016 in Chapter III letter A points a and b explicitly stipulate that the appointment of Tukin data manager and Control Book Manager is based on the Decision of the Regency / City KPU Secretary. In reality, the Ternate City KPU Secretary never issued a Tukin Data Manager Decree and Control Book Manager. The decree of Tukin Manager was not made, other than signaling the lack of discipline in administration; it also contributed attitude of Tukin Manager. Especially for control book manager, whose job is massive but noble. Because as KPU Secretary General decree No 849/2015 that the criteria of officials appointed as Control Book Managers must have integrity, discipline, responsibility, firmness, and accuracy. The cessation electronic application attendance recording was due to two uncertain reasons - the first reason was that the finger machine was broken, and the second reason for the damaged computer - was a bad precedent for how the Tukin Manager would not be responsible for the problem. For finger machine and computer damage, there has not been deep attention and severe responsibility to repair or replace it. Indeed, KPU Secretary General Decree No. 53/2016 regulates the state of force majeure. One of them is if there is damage to the attendance machine. But that must be proven by a statement from the KPU. What is shown by the Tukin Managing Officer who is silent about the problems of finger machine and computer damage is referred to as maladministration? That is the tendency not to take the initiative but to wait for orders from above, even though by law, it allows him to act or take policy initiatives. The other attitude that was shown by the Managing Officer that he was inconsistent in cutting Tukin. Whereas based on the recapitulation report presence in 2017, primarily for January to August, the discipline level of employees is low or does not reach the attendance weight of

40%. That means employees who do not meet the attendance weight of 40% are subject to cuts which differ in amount according to their absence. The attitude of employees receiving Tukin, especially in terms of time discipline, is essential to obey. In general, time discipline is interpreted as an attitude or behavior that shows compliance with working hours which includes attendance and compliance during working hours and employees can carry out tasks in a timely and correct manner. In this study, time discipline was interpreted in a limited way, the obedience employees to five working days (Monday to Friday) and the number of hours worked (37.5 hours). This refers to the Decree of KPU Secretary General No. 53/2016. To measure compliance level using an analysis Monthly Attendance Recapitulation Report in 2017. The results were found impressive data employee compliance level from January to August 2017 was lower, compared to September to December 2017 as can be seen in Table 2. Based on Table 2, there is a striking difference between attendance recapitulation reports based on electronic attendance recording with attendance recapitulation reports based on manual attendance recording. Jabir Salim, S.Pd, KPU staff while on duty at the South Halmahera Regency KPU Secretariat gave a surprising answer about his name in the report on attendance recapitulation for October and November 2017, which was written for six days respectively. Jabir Salim even shows proof of payment for Tukin in October and November 2017, which received in full into his account. That the method of recording electronic attendance as outlined in the monthly attendance recapitulation report for January to August 2017 is more reliable and accountable. Compared to the manual process contained in the Attendance recapitulation report per month from September to December 2017.

**Table 2.** Presence weight of civil servant in Ternate KPU secretariat in 2017

Months	Number of civil servants	Compliance Level According to Attendance Weight		Explanations
		40%	< 40%	
January	23	6	17	Electronic attendance
February	23	2	21	Electronic attendance
March	23	11	12	Electronic attendance
April	23	21	2	Electronic attendance
May	23	14	9	Electronic attendance
June	23	11	12	Electronic attendance
July	23	13	10	Electronic attendance
August	23	16	7	Electronic attendance
September	23	23	-	Manual attendance
October	23	23	1	Manual attendance
November	23	23	1	Manual attendance
December	23	23	-	Manual attendance

The decision of KPU No. 53/2016 stipulates that Tukin received by employees is determined based on performance achievements as measured by the presence according to working days and hours. Five working days from Monday to Friday. The total number of hours worked is 37.5 hours. The Tukin deduction factors are as follows; late attendance, return before time, neglect to fill in the attendance list, leaving office

without permission, not present without information, not present because of service, not present due to leave permit, not present because of a sick, learning task, disciplinary punishment, and temporarily dismissed from certain functional positions. Employees who are temporarily dismissed from functional positions because they cannot collect credit numbers with applicable provisions, the Performance Allowance will be paid in the amount of 75% until the relevant person is reappointed in the position. Standard operating procedure (SOP) or Tukin technical guidelines, based on analysis results have not been able to discipline employees because deduction does not provide a shock and deterrent effect for employees. For example, if a Job 9 Class employee (head of subdivision at the Regency / City KPU Secretariat) absent for 20 days (150 hours of work), then he receives the Tukin. He will be rewarded for IDR. 2,008,800. That means the performance allowance deducted is only IDR. 1,339,200. As a function of management, the mechanism of oversight of an organization is necessary [14]. The implementation of a plan and program without being accompanied by an intensive and continuous supervision system will result in slow, or even not achieving the intended goals and objectives. Because Tukin Manager acted on behalf of Ternate KPU and was in charge of carrying out internal supervision, of course, activities, they carried out had to have legality in appointment Tukin manager decree. Ternate KPU secretary ignored this. The concluded that the secretary must be responsible for legality and professionalism of Tukin Managers (upstream factors) to cause administrative and financial problems, such as a broken fingerprint machine without knowing exactly what caused it, employee discipline decreased with the re-application of manual attendance. And Tukin payments are not based on employee attendance recapitulation reports.

### 3.2. Summary of Research Findings

Based on the discussion results of factors that affect the Tukin implementation in Ternate City KPU Secretariat, the review of research findings as seen in Table 3.

**Table 3.** Factors that effect on Tukin policy

Variables	Research Findings
Communication	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Policy Dissemination: The Ternate KPU Secretary did not correctly socialize Circular No. 849/2015 and Decree No. 53/2016 so that he appointed the Tukin Managing Officer without a decree.</li> <li>2. Communication of Subordinates: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The form of communication to socialize the General Election Commission Decree No. 53/2016 is more oral than writing.</li> </ol> </li> </ol>
Resources	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Availability of Funds: The availability of funds (budget) for Tukin payments has never been a problem, including to pay for 5 Ternate City KPU staff assigned temporarily at the Regency / City KPU in North Maluku. Even since 2016, Tukin is directly transferred to the account of each employee.</li> </ol>

Disposition	<p>2. Facilities and infrastructure: A fingerprint is only used for eight months (January.d. August 2017), and there is no certainty when the finger will be re-applied.</p> <p>3. Tukin Manager's Legality and Professionalism: 1. Tukin managers work without decree. 2. Tukin managers have not reflected five criteria: Integrity, Discipline, Responsibility, Decisiveness, and Care.</p> <p>1. An attitude of Tukin Managing Officer: a. Employee attendance performance based on manual attendance recording results is better than using electronic attendance records. But based on the results of observations and interviews, it is just the opposite. Namely, the attendance performance of employees based on automatic attendance recording is far better than using manual attendance recording. b. The deduction of Tukin is not by the weight of attendance, so that some employees who do not enter the office for a few days, the Tukin is still paid in full.</p>
Bureaucratic Structure	<p>1. An attitude of Tukin Recipient Staff: a. Tukin recipient employees do not question Tukin deductions as long as they are by the number of their absence. b. The level of discipline of employees decreases with the re-registration of manual attendance.</p> <p>2. Technical Guidelines for the Implementation of Tukin Giving: a. The percentage of Tukin cutting is relatively mild so employees who do not enter the office for 20 working days (150 working hours), still receive Tukin. b. The mild percentage of Tukin cutting does not provide a shock effect and deterrent effect for employees so that the discipline of employees does not experience an increase especially after returning to applying attendance records manual.</p> <p>3. Weak Internal Oversight: Tukin managers can act on behalf of the Ternate City KPU Secretary to supervise if they have SK and fulfill five criteria: Integrity, Discipline, Responsibility, Firmness, and Meticulous.</p>

Based on the table, the factors that influence the barriers to the implementation of the Performance Allowance policy are more dominant than the factors that influence their success. It is clear that only the resource variable (with one indicator, namely the availability of funds) supports the successful implementation of the Tukin administration policy. While other variables, such as communication, resources (signs of facilities and infrastructure, and human resources), disposition and bureaucratic structure are the inhibiting factors for the implementation of the Tukin administration policy in the Ternate KPU Secretariat.

#### 4 CONCLUSIONS

The policy of performance allowances (Tukin) increasing issued by the KPU Secretary General through Decree No. 53/2016, has not been able to improve presence performance

Ternate KPU staff. Factors that cause the increase in employee attendance performance include; 1) the socialization of KPU Secretary General's Decree N. 53/2016 is not well-done, continuous and in-depth; 2) lack of communication in writing that explains technical matters and is substantially related to the enactment of KPU Secretary General's Decree No. 53/2016; 3) termination of electronic attendance recording and return using manual attendance opens room for manipulation of employee attendance; 4) low discipline, including administrative discipline, applying electric attendance discipline, and employee discipline on working hours; and 5) deduction of Tukin are relatively mild, so they do not cause shock and deterrent effects for employees.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] Dwiyatno, Agus, (2014), *Realizing Good Governance Through Public Services*, Gadjah Mada University Press: Yogyakarta.
- [2] Deni, Saiful, (2015), *Reform Public Administration: Thought of Local Government Reform*, Naufan Library: Yogyakarta.
- [3] Dwiyanto, Agus, et al., (2012), *Public Bureaucratic Reform in Indonesia*, Gadjah Mada University Press: Yogyakarta. (In Bahasa)
- [4] Ongaro, E., Valotti, G., (2008), *Public Management Reform in Italy: Explaining the Implementation Gap*. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 21(2), 174-204.
- [5] Wang, H., Yu, X., Wan, W., Swaminathan, R., (2012), *Robust Audio Fingerprint Extraction Algorithm Based on 2-D Chroma*, In 2012 International Conference on Audio, Language and Image Processing (pp. 763-767). IEEE.
- [6] Ahmad, J., (2015), *Research Methods in Public Administration: Theory and Application*, Gava Media: Yogyakarta. (In Bahasa)
- [7] Moleong, (2005), *Qualitative Methodology*, Remaja Rosda Karya: Bandung. (In Bahasa)
- [8] Fischer, Frank. et al., (2015), *Handbook of Public Policy Analysis: Theory, Politics, and Methods*, Translator: Imam Baihaqie, Nusa Media: Bandung. (In Bahasa)
- [9] Sugiyono, (2012), *Quantitative, Qualitative, and R and D. Research Methods*, Alfabeta: Bandung. (In Bahasa)
- [10] Prastowo, A., (2012), *Qualitative Research Methods in the Research Design Perspective*, Ar-Ruzz Media: Yogyakarta. (In Bahasa)
- [11] Pace, R. Wayne, Faules, Don, F., (2000), *Organizational Communication*, Rosda: Bandung. (In Bahasa)
- [12] Danish, R. Q., Usman, A., (2010), *Impact of Reward and Recognition on Job Satisfaction and Motivation: An Empirical Study from Pakistan*. *International journal of business and management*, 5(2), 159.
- [13] Vega, G., (2003), *Managing teleworkers and telecommuting strategies*, Greenwood Publishing Group.
- [14] The reason, J., (2016), *Managing the Risks of Organizational Accidents*, Routledge.