

Effect Of Public Participation To Improve The Election Commission (KPU) Performance In Ternate City Mayor Election

Abdul Halil Hi. Ibrahim

Abstract: This study aims to find the effect and role of public participation in improving the performance of general election commission (KPU) on Ternate city Mayor election of North Maluku Province. The research method used is survey method, which is observed directly the object being studied conducted on large or small population but the data are taken and that will be studied is the sample from the population. The data is qualitative that is cumulative by using a statistical method. The research model uses a simple linear analysis of the relationship of public participation in improving the performance of KPU. The data were collected by interviews and observations, while the tools used in data collection were questionnaires. Stages of data analysis as follows; validity and reliability test, classical assumption test, linear regression analysis, determination analysis, and hypothesis test. The result shows that the variable data for all test shows the accuracy and validity is very good, so it is known that the effect of public participation on the performance of KPU in Ternate City is 54.9%. This indicates importance role of public participation to the election commission performance in Ternate City, related to horizontal, vertical, relationships, means, decision-making, security and order, political, economic, social, cultural, decision-making, activity planning, implementation activities, monitoring, and evaluation of activities and utilization of results of activities.

Index Terms: Indonesia democracy, reliability and validity, decision making, evaluation of activity.

1 INTRODUCTION

The principle of democracy is to put power in the hands of the people. The measurement of the success of the democratic system is the higher the society's participation then higher the level of democracy. In a democratic system, the people's political participation is a pillar that builds on the success of the system. Forms of popular participation such as participating in elections, oversight of state officials, as well as determination in public policy. In most democracies, elections are democratic elements and are considered symbols as well as benchmarks of the implementation of democracy. Robert A. Dahl proposed five democratic criteria, namely; a) Equality of suffrage in determining collective binding decisions; b) Effective participation, equal opportunity for all citizens in the collective decision-making process; c) Disclosure of the truth, namely the equal opportunity for each person to provide an assessment of the course of the political process and government; d) The final control of the agenda, namely the existence of exclusive powers for the community to determine the agenda which should and should not be decided through government; e) Incomplete society in relation to law [1-3]. Democracy has been regarded as an important instrument in carrying out an ideal state conception to answer the question of the enforcement of popular power. Indonesia which explicitly understands the importance of a people's sovereignty and participates in democracy with its own variants. A democracy that continues to grow and flourish in its political transition process which undergoes various maturation of the political behavior of the state and its people which is expected to lead to an ideal condition of politics.

As a manifestation of the implementation of democracy, elections are held on a direct, public, free, secret, honest and fair basis. This five-year agenda was held to give the widest space for the community to self-determine their representatives. This is where the elections become a means of the implementation of people's sovereignty, respect for the political rights of the people, and the noble values inherent in the soul of the Indonesia people. The election of regional government is the process of providing local democratic means for the community in determining its voting right on the day of voting. In order to realize the rights of the people, who have the right to vote, that is, the age of 17 (seventeen) years or have been married, it is necessary to have accuracy in the preparation of voter lists as well as the provision of adequate and wide space for voters to be registered and or actively participate in registering itself as a voter, since the election to the election of the voter list becomes one of the never-ending problems, it is in the process of drafting the voter list at the mayoral election in Ternate City starting with the comparison of Potential Voters Data (DP4) submitted by the Regional Government to the General Election Commission (KPU) of Ternate City as well as voter data in the last election, namely the Presidential Election of Indonesia in 2014. The process of preparing the election list in regional simultaneously election in 2015 begins with the submission of DP4 data by the Regional Government to central KPU and then submit the result of DP4 data synchronization to the KPU of Ternate to be used as initial data in updating the voter list. The performance of KPU in the general election of Ternate City Mayor is basically to know the work achieved by KPU as a visionary state institution. The mission of KPU Ternate City itself cannot be separated from the mission carried out in a hierarchical manner that is improving the implementation of clean, efficient and effective election. In relation to the KPU mission, KPU's performance can be assessed based on three factors: human resources, organizational structure and leadership. These three factors into the study materials where the factor of one with other factors have a correlation. First, human resources are human elements such as the presence of apparatus in Ternate City KPU. The apparatus consists of the commissioners, all KPU members who are obliged to realize

- Abdul Halil Hi. Ibrahim is Associate Professor of Social and Political Science Universitas Muhammadiyah Maluku Utara, Ternate, Indonesia, Email: halil_ibrahim@ymail.com

the results of plenary meetings into tasks within a working group or division. Secretariat of the apparatus who has a position as a Civil Servant (PNS) assigned in Ternate City KPU whose main duty is support to the commissioners in the form of technical and administrative support one of which is the provision of funds to activities that will be done by the commissioner who has been established through the results of plenary meetings. The public has a very important role in organizing a democratic party just like the election of the regional head. Therefore, society cannot be separated with the election because it is a unified whole where the public becomes the main factor and the determinant of the success of an election. Implementation of the election affects the process of development of a government policy that governs the community a lot. Therefore, it is time we provide a valuable learning to the public about the meaning and meaning of an election itself, so that people do not fall into a mistake when choosing a candidate. Learning and socialization is an influential and must be done so that people really know about the election. In addition to providing technical guidance, the people of Indonesia still need to be given an understanding of how to give their right to vote properly and not because it is influenced by other things that do not benefit the community itself. Basically, the goal is to provide correct clues related to elections rather than just looking for benefits that can harm the public so that people are only used as a puppet of political play by irresponsible person. Research on the participation of civil society and the role of civil society in general elections in various countries has been widely applied and contributed significantly to the improvement of the performance of the electoral commission, such as the elections to democracy in central Europe; the public participation and the role of civil society [4]; civil society in Central and Eastern Europe: The ambivalent legacy of accession [5], protest, social movements and global democracy 2011 [6]. Based on the above description it is important to conduct a study related to the role and participation of the community in improving the performance of the Election Commission (KPU) on the Ternate City mayor election of North Maluku Province.

2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The method used in this research is survey method, that is directly observe the object being studied conducted on large or small population but the data are taken and to be studied is sample data from the population. The data is qualitative that is cumulative by using a statistical method. To know as the variables studied it will explain the object of study through the collected data, using associative research is a study that looks for the relationship of one variable with other variables. The research model uses a simple linear analysis of the relationship of public participation in improving the performance of electoral commissaries. Public participation is the determination of attitudes and involvement of each individual's desire in the situation and condition of the organization, so that ultimately the individual person to participate in the achievement of organizational objectives, and take part in any mutual accountability. Public participation is the score obtained by respondents in answering the questionnaire 15 items in a structure and measurement parameters using Likert scale [7] with a score of 1 to 5 (positive statement) and 5 to 1 negative statements. The indicators on these variables are: horizontal, vertical,

relationships, means, decision making, security and order, politics, economy, social, culture, decision making, activity planning, activity execution, monitoring and evaluation of activities and utilization of activity results. The description of community participation as shown in Table 1. The performance of the General Election Commission is an ability that has the only trustworthy evidence to conclude whether an organization, unit or employee is successful or failing, achieving or not. To assess a performance requires an overall understanding. There are three kinds of performance goals that are known, namely; organizational performance, unit performance and KPU performance. Performance of General Election Commission is the score obtained by respondents in answering the questionnaire of 15 items in a structured and measurement parameters using Likert scale with a score of 1 to 5 (positive statement) and 5 to 1 negative statements. The indicators of this variable are: preparing someone, improving conditions, assigning tasks, basics, comparators, determinants, successes, loyalty, crafts, abilities, development, relationships, carrying out tasks, accountability and feedback as in Table 2.

Table 1: Research variables of public participation (after Mardiasmo, 2002)

Variable	Dimensions	Indicators	Questionnaire items
Public Participation	Form of participation	- Horizontal	1
		- Vertical	2
		- Relationship ways	3
		- Decision making	4
			5
	Participation creation	- Security and order	6
		- Politic	7
		- Economy	8
		- Social	9
Stages of participation	- Culture	10	
	- Decision making	11	
	- Planning	12	
	- Implementation	13	
	- Evaluation and control	14	
	- Utilization of activity results	15	

Table 2: Variable Performance of the KPU (after Heidjrachman, 2005)

Variable	Dimensions	Indicators	Questionnaire items
KPU Performance	Quality improvement	- Setting up someone	1
		- Fixed the condition	2
		- Give tasks	3
		- legal basis	4
		- Comparison	5
		- Determinants	6
	Factors assessed	- Success	7
		- Loyalty	8
		- diligent	9
		- Ability	10
	Performance information	- Development	11
		- Relationship	12
		- Carry out the task	13
		- Accountable	14
		- Feedback	15

The population in this study consists of political parties, bureaucracy (Echelon II, III & IV), Mayor candidates, KPU, successful teams and 731 people. In conducting a study, we often encounter populations that we have homogeneous staff, but hetegons, ie the characteristics of various population. The research sample was drawn by random sampling proportional stratified proportional random sampling technique, ie random

sampling in populations that have been grouped (population) based on group stratum from population in Ternate City of North Maluku Province. This technique is used when the population has members or elements that are not homogeneous and stratified proportionately. List of population and sample details such as Table 3.

Table 3: Population and Sample

Informant	Population	Sample
Political parties (Golkar, PAN, PPP, Gerindra dan PKS)	8	5
Bureaucracy (Eselon II, III & IV)	94	59
Mayor Candidates	7	4
KPU	18	11
Candidates Team	204	129
Public	400	252
Total	731	460

The data were collected by interviews and observations, while the tools used in data collection were questionnaires. Stages of data analysis as follows; validity and reliability test, classical assumption test, linear regression analysis, determination analysis, and hypothesis test.

3 RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Object of Research

Ternate City is a city under the Gamalama volcano on Ternate Island in North Maluku Province, Indonesia. Ternate became an autonomous city since August 4, 2010, and became the temporary capital of North Maluku Province until Sofifi became its capital on Halmahera Island, ready for infrastructure. History of this city begins with the Sultanate of Ternate which stood around the 13th century on Ternate Island, which makes this city as the center of government. Kornelis Matelief de Jonge in 1607 built a fortress in this city area, called Fort Oranje and was previously named Malayu. Ternate is an archipelago town with an area of 547,736 km², with 8 islands. Ternate Island, Hiri Island, Moti Island, Mayau Island, and Tifure Island are the five islands with populations, while there are three other islands such as Maka Island, Mano Island and Gurida Island are small uninhabited islands. The topographic condition of Ternate City with most of the mountainous and hilly areas consists of volcanic and coral islands with the conditions of Rogusal soil type (Ternate Island, Hiri Island and Moti Island) and Rensika (Mayau Island, Tifure Island, Pulau Maka, Mano Island and Gurida Island). The topography condition of Ternate City is also characterized by the diversity of altitude and sea level between 0-700 m above sea level. Climate is heavily influenced by the sea climate and has two seasons which are often interspersed with two times of transition each year. Sultan Babullah Airport is a means of air transportation in Ternate City. Some airlines that serve this route include Garuda Indonesia, Sriwijaya Air, Batavia Air, Wings Air (Lion Air Group), Merpati Airlines, Express Air and Trigana Air. Flights via Makassar, Manado and Sorong. The city also has Ahmad Yani sea port with cruise lines that pass Indonesia national shipping (Pelni) ship twice per week. Two freight shipping companies are Mentari and Tanto. Land transportation in this city using passenger transport by car. Since the end of 2005 has started to operate a private-owned taxi fleet with a total fleet of about 50 units. To cross to the surrounding islands such as Halmahera, Tidore, Hiri, Moti, Meitara, can use a small boat from fiberglass commonly called *Speed*. North Maluku has a variety of regional specialties such as popeda (sagu), crab walnut, halua walnuts, bagea and processed fish such as smoked fish (Fufu fish), gohu fish, rica fish rica and others. Jewelry from this area is the pearl of the sea and the Bacan Stone.

The KPU of Ternate City

One year after the 1999 Indonesia general election, the government and parliament passed Law No. 4, 2000 on amendment to Law No. 3, 1999 in respect to General Elections. The main content of Law no. 4/2000 is an important change, namely that the holding of the 2004 general elections is conducted by an independent and nonpartisan Election Commission (KPU). Independent and nonpartisan is the new label that is carried by the KPU at this time. The new KPU consists of members elected from independent and nonpartisan persons. The formation of such a KPU cannot be

released by past KPU activities, in the 1999 election. At that time, the KPU consists of party functionaries participating in the General Elections. In the course of KPU at that time, the public saw clearly how very strong interest element coloring every KPU activity, so very often in the discussion of KPU decisions must face deadlock situation. This fact is certainly not encouraging, especially in view of the development of image and development of KPU as an organizer of the General Election. On the premise that the KPU as an election organizer should be free from the pressure of interests, and strong demands from many parties that the election organizer must be clear from the intervention of political parties and the government, the parliament together with the government issued Law No.4 of 2000 which expressly stated that KPU members consist of independent and non-partisan persons. The independent and nonpartisan of the KPU is currently reflected in the selection process of KPU member candidates. The all candidates for the KPU nominated by the president to the parliament for approval, none of them comes from political parties. In general, candidates come from universities and non-governmental organizations (NGOs). More clearly the requirements to become a member of the KPU in more detail are as follows; 1) Physically and mentally healthy; 2) Be entitled to vote and vote; 3) Have a strong commitment to the upholding of democracy and justice; 4) Having strong, honest and fair personal integrity; 5) Have adequate knowledge about politics, party, election and leadership ability; 6) Not being a member or manager of a political party; 7) Not occupying political positions and structural positions in public servant positions. The KPU is a national, permanent and independent institution. This is stated in the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia and the Law in respect to general elections. All members of the KPU and its supporters are aware that the people want the 2004 elections to be more qualified than the previous elections. Therefore, in the 2004 General Elections, the KPU should be able to organize the election by prioritizing the achievement of the general principles of electoral administration, namely; direct, public, free, secret, honest and fair, and civilized. In order to support the achievement of these targets, the KPU has prepared a number of regulations applicable to election organizers. For example, the rules of procedure of the KPU and the Election Ethics Code. In addition to the rights of obligations as stipulated in the provisions of legislation, the KPU is also obliged; 1) Implement and comply with state laws and regulations; 2) Carry out duties honestly and fairly; 3) Respect the principle of openness and the importance of providing appropriate, honest, and accountable information to the public; 4) Carry out the tasks established under the Act; 5) Ensure that every election participant, including political parties, candidates for legislative members and voters, is treated equally and equitably '6) Carries out coordinated duties among members or with relevant agencies; 7) Support the monitoring of elections in order to run effectively and efficiently.

Description of Variable Data for Public Participation

The results of questionnaires distribution for data of public participation variables showed that the lowest score was 2.67 and the highest score was 5.00. Given the lowest and highest scores, the range of scores is 2.33. The numbers after analyzing resulted in average scores (Mean) = 4.0387, variance (Variance) = 0.186, and standard deviation = 0.43129. If presented in table form, then the frequency

distribution of community participation scores as in Table 4.

Table 4: Frequency Distribution of Pubic Participation Variables

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid 2.67	1	.2	.2	.2
2.80	1	.2	.2	.4
2.93	2	.4	.4	.9
3.00	5	1.1	1.1	2.0
3.07	2	.4	.4	2.4
3.13	7	1.5	1.5	3.9
3.20	5	1.1	1.1	5.0
3.27	3	.7	.7	5.7
3.33	4	.9	.9	6.5
3.40	8	1.7	1.7	8.3
3.47	7	1.5	1.5	9.8
3.53	17	3.7	3.7	13.5
3.60	11	2.4	2.4	15.9
3.67	14	3.0	3.0	18.9
3.73	18	3.9	3.9	22.8
3.80	17	3.7	3.7	26.5
3.87	32	7.0	7.0	33.5
3.93	35	7.6	7.6	41.1
4.00	54	11.7	11.7	52.8
4.07	24	5.2	5.2	58.0
4.13	27	5.9	5.9	63.9
4.20	30	6.5	6.5	70.4
4.27	19	4.1	4.1	74.6
4.33	21	4.6	4.6	79.1
4.40	10	2.2	2.2	81.3
4.47	16	3.5	3.5	84.8
4.53	13	2.8	2.8	87.6
4.60	16	3.5	3.5	91.1
4.67	4	.9	.9	92.0
4.73	10	2.2	2.2	94.1
4.80	7	1.5	1.5	95.7
4.87	16	3.5	3.5	99.1
4.93	2	.4	.4	99.6
5.00	2	.4	.4	100.0
Total	460	100.0	100.0	

Based on Table 4, it can be interpreted that the political participation of the public is one form of actualization of the democratization process, which is 90.2% of respondents agree with the results in question. This desire becomes very important for the public in the process of political development for developing countries like in Indonesia, because there are rights and obligations of the public that can be done one of them is where the performance process of the KPU is done directly. This system opens space and brings people to be directly involved in the process. Implementation of campaigns by candidates of local elections was also not as vibrant as previous elections due to the lack of campaign props (APK) and budget constraints facilitated by the KPU. Nevertheless, North Maluku KPU will make maximum effort to facilitate candidate pairs campaign through socialization in print and electronic mass media, or directly. Through the socialization in print and electronic media, North Maluku Provincial KPU hopes to help the public voting to know the implementation of the election and who the candidates will be carried. The reGENCY KPU will also go down and socialize with the voters and relevant stakeholders. The active role of candidates who will compete in local elections will also encourage an increase in voter turnout. The candidates are expected to be creative and convincing in delivering the vision and mission and the flagship program to attract voters. From the analysis results obtained the frequency distribution of public participation

variables as in Table 5.

Table 5: Frequency Distribution of Variable Score of Public Participation

Perception of Respondents	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Strongly Disagree	18	0,26
Disagree	291	4,22
Less Agree	1.070	15,51
Agree	3.548	51,42
Strongly agree	1.973	28,59
Total	6.900	100

Based on Table 5, it is known that public participation is included in either category. This can be seen from 5,521 or 80,01% respondents appreciate statement with good response to public participation in Ternate City. Perceptions of respondents to the dimensions of public participation variables such as Table 6-8. Dimensions of participation form consists of 5 (five) indicators, namely horizontal, vertical, relationships, ways, decision-making. Based on Table 6, it is known that 350 or 15.22% of respondents are in the average group, 109 respondents or 4.73% are below the average and 1,841 respondents or 80.05% above the average. From the above description, it can be said that the form of participation is included in either category. This can be seen from 1,841 or 80,05% of respondents appreciate the statement with good response to the form of participation in Ternate.

Table 6: Perceptions of Respondents on Form Dimensions of Participation

Perception of Respondents	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Strongly Disagree	13	0,56
Disagree	96	4,17
Less Agree	350	15,22
Agree	1.227	53,35
Strongly agree	614	26,7
Total	2.300	100

Table 7: Perceptions of Respondents on the Dimension of Participation Creation

Perception of Respondents	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Strongly Disagree	3	0,13
Disagree	95	4,13
Less Agree	361	15,7
Agree	1.133	49,26
Strongly agree	708	30,78
Total	2.300	100

Table 8: Perceptions of Respondents on Dimensions of Participation Stage

Perception of Respondents	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Strongly Disagree	2	0,09
Disagree	100	4,35
Less Agree	359	15,61

Agree	1.188	51,65
Strongly agree	651	28,30
Total	2.300	100

While the dimensions of the responsibility process consist of 5 (five) indicators, namely security and order, political, economic, social, and cultural. Based on Table 7, it is seen that 361 or 15.7% of respondents are in the average group, 98 respondents or 4.26% are below the average and 1,841 respondents or 80.04% above the average. From the above information, it can be concluded that the dimension of participation is included in the good category. This can be seen from 1,841 or 80,04% respondents appreciate the statement with very good response to the creation of participation in Ternate City. Meanwhile, for the dimension of participation phase consists of 5 (five) indicators, namely decision-making, activity planning, implementation of activities, monitoring and evaluation of activities, utilization of activity results. From the calculation of Table 8, it is seen that 359 or 15.61% of respondents are in the average group, 102 respondents or 4.44% are below the average and 1,839 respondents or 79.95% above the average. Thus, it can be concluded that the dimensions of the participation phase are included in either category. This can be seen from about 1,839 or 79.95% of respondents appreciate the statement with good response to the dimension of participation in Ternate. From the results analysis is known that the three dimensions that have the significantly affected in determining public participation with the dimension of participation form is 80.05%.

Reliability, Validity, and Multicollinearity Test

Reliability and validity test of raw data is conducted to check the consistency of the measuring tool and the validity of each questionnaire. To obtain accurate calculation results, the process using computer program SPSS. The result of reliability and validation test toward public participation variable and KPU performance showed good reliability level with reliability coefficient $> 0,6$. While validity test result to both variable showed very valid. The multicollinearity test is performed to find out whether there is collinearity or not among independent variables. The method used is to calculate tolerance and Variance Inflation Factor (VIF). From the calculation of computer with SPSS program obtained Tolerance value (attached) for each research stage. The results of this test show an excellent level of suitability.

The Role of Public Participation in Improving the Performance of KPU

Furthermore, based on the analysis of all variable and test data to determine the accuracy and validity, it can be explained the important role of public participation in improving KPU's performance. The form of political participation of a visible in his political activities. Based on the voters' statements of public participation they do in the form of; a) Voting; b) Campaign; c) Speaking of political issues; d) As a party of political parties. The form of participation of one's society will be seen in its political activities. The most common form of political participation is voting, either to vote for a candidate or a regional head. Voters, as an integral part of society, also have an important share in the success of direct elections. The forms of political participation undertaken by the electorate are no different from other people's political activities. The regional head election (PILKADA) is a series of

democratic parties of Indonesian society which will then be continued with the presidential and vice presidentials elections. Therefore, it is not surprising that people are so enthusiastic about the success of the show. This can be proved based on interviews with respondents indicating that all respondents interviewed used their voting right in the election. They do so for a variety of reasons, including political awareness because they feel that it is a duty. Besides that, is the easiness factor in doing this political activity. The results of this study are in line with the opinion of Michael Rush and Phillip Althoff which states that the most common form of political participation is the voting. Voting is a form of political participation that does not require much effort. This activity is done when needed. To do this activity is necessary only a little initiative [10]. If associated with the opinion of Roth and Wilson, then this form of political participation is also located at the bottom of the position. Because such a pyramid, with the majority of political participation lies below. This means that the intensity of political participation of most citizens is at the level of observers. Those belonging to this group usually engage in political activities such as: attending general meetings, becoming party members/interest groups, discussing political issues, following political developments through mass media, and voting in local elections. Political participation will be aligned whenever the political process runs steadily. Often there are barriers to political participation when political stability cannot be realized, because it is important for the power holders to carry out the process of political stabilization. In addition, the next process of political institutionalization efforts as a form of efforts to provide a placement to the public to actualize his ideals [11]. Political participation is nothing more than an individual's involvement to a variety of levels, or substantially explained, either by means of an effort or organized by a good constituent or citizen to elect leaders they value as well. This participation they do so with full responsibility for the common life within the scope of a nation and state. Political participation is emphasized on aspects to support the interests or visions and missions of a certain political elite. As a wise society we must participate in the general elections process in order to determine the leader who will lead us. Thus, we will indirectly determine policy makers who will seek to prosper society in general. In participating in the electoral process as an intelligent community we must be able to assess the best candidates who are capable and willing to listen the public aspirations so that development will be done in accordance with the wishes of the public and not choose candidates who are only selfish or group just so forget the promises already spoken during the campaign period. As the owner of voter rights in the election we should not squander the voting rights just for the temporary lure that in the sense we must cast our vote to the right candidate.

5 CONCLUSIONS

The research on effect of public participation in improving the performance of the KPU in the Ternate City Mayor election, North Maluku was conducted with methods and tests of accuracy and excellent data validity. Based on this result, it is concluded that the Public Participation effect on the Performance of Ternate City KPU is 54.9%. This indicates the importance of public participation to the performance of the election commission in Ternate City, related to horizontal, vertical, relationships, means, decision-making, security and

order, political, economic, social, cultural, decision-making, activity planning, implementation activities, monitoring and evaluation of activities and utilization of results of activities.

REFERENCES

- [1] Dahl, Robert . (1971). *Polyarchy*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- [2] Munck, G.L, Verkuilen, J., (2002), Conceptualizing and measuring democracy: Evaluating alternative indices, *Comparative Political Studies* 35 (1), 5-34.
- [3] Janja Mikulan Kildi, Matej Makarovič. (2017) Towards a Model Explaining the Political (In)stability and Variety of Regimes in the Post-Soviet Region. *Comparative Sociology* 16:1, 66-101.
- [4] Ackerman, S. Rose, (2007), From elections to democracy in Central Europe: Public participation and the role of civil society, *East European Politics and Societies*, 21(1), 31-47.
- [5] A Kutter, V Trappmann, (2010), Civil society in Central and Eastern Europe: The ambivalent legacy of accession *Acta Politica*, 45 (1-2), 41–69.
- [6] Ishkanian, Armine, (2016), Protest, Social Movements and Global Democracy Since 2011: New Perspectives. Vol. 39, Issue. , p. 107
- [7] Likert, R. (1932). A Technique for the Measurement of Attitudes. *Archives of Psychology*, 140, 1–55.
- [8] Mardiasmo, (2002), *Autonomy and Regional Financial Management*, Yogyakarta, Andi Offset (In Indonesia).
- [9] Ranupandojo, Heijdrachman, (2005), *Personnel Management*, Yogyakarta : Penerbit BPFE (In Indonesia).
- [10] Michael Rush, Philip Althoff, (1971), *An introduction to political sociology*, the University of California, Nelson, (Digitized 11 March, 2009).
- [11] Suryadi, Prawirosentono, (2003), *Employee Performance Policy*, BPFE, Gajah Mada, Yogyakarta (In Indonesia).